

Educational analysis on the pathology of the Civil Service Management Law with emphasis on the prevailing systemic approach to various areas of human resource management in government organizations in Iran

Análise educacional sobre a patologia da Lei de Gestão da Função Pública com ênfase na abordagem sistêmica predominante em várias áreas de gestão de recursos humanos em organizações governamentais no Irã

Shirko Khosravi Nia*
Farhad Nejad Irani**
Gholamreza Rahimi***
Seiied Abdollah Hojjati****

Abstract

The purpose of this study is to examine the pathology of the Civil Service Management Law by emphasizing the prevailing systemic approach to various areas of human resource management in government organizations in Iran. The method of this research is descriptive-survey. Statistical samples were selected through quota and judgmental sampling. First, the interview was conducted with a statistical sample and then with the Delphi method of three stages and exploratory factor analysis. The classification of injuries in the Civil Service Law was performed according to the system characteristics in seven categories. The results showed that pathology has been studied in terms of generalization characteristics such as lack of systems, severe bureaucracy and neglect of the environment. This factor can be divided into four categories of recruitment, employment and supply and maintenance of human resources. Other pathologies include ignoring the environment despite extensive communication. According to the results we can said that Civil service management law for various reasons such as inflexibility, uncoordinated subsystems, static, non-dependence and interaction of subsystems, etc. has led to various consequences in the input and output sections of the system in the administrative system of government organizations.

Keywords: Civil Service Management Law. Pathology. Systematic Attitude. Human Resources Strategies.

* Department of Public Administration, Bonab Branch, Islamic Azad University, Bonab, Iran, <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6209-3474>; Email: shirkokhosravinia@gmail.com

** Department of Public Administration, Bonab Branch, Islamic Azad University, Bonab, Iran, <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5206-0318>; Corresponding Author, Email: farhadirani90@yahoo.com

*** Department of Public Administration, Bonab Branch, Islamic Azad University, Bonab, Iran, <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0877-1806>; Email: rahimi62@gmail.com

**** Department of Public Administration, Bonab Branch, Islamic Azad University, Bonab, Iran, <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0316-9739>; Email: abdollahbonabi@gmail.com

Resumo

O objetivo deste estudo é examinar a patologia da Lei de Gestão da Função Pública, enfatizando a abordagem sistêmica predominante em várias áreas de gestão de recursos humanos em organizações governamentais no Irã. O método desta pesquisa é um estudo descritivo. As amostras estatísticas foram selecionadas através de cotas e amostragens de julgamento. Primeiro, a entrevista foi conduzida com uma amostra estatística e depois com o método Delphi de três etapas e análise exploratória de fatores. A classificação de lesões na Lei da Função Pública foi realizada de acordo com as características do sistema em sete categorias. Os resultados mostraram que a patologia tem sido estudada em termos de características de generalização, tais como falta de sistemas, burocracia severa e negligência do meio ambiente. Este fator pode ser dividido em quatro categorias de recrutamento, emprego e fornecimento e manutenção de recursos humanos. Outras patologias incluem ignorar o meio ambiente apesar da extensa comunicação. De acordo com os resultados podemos dizer que a lei de gestão da função pública por várias razões, tais como inflexibilidade, subsistemas descoordenados, estática, não dependência e interação de subsistemas, etc., levou a várias conseqüências nas seções de entrada e saída do sistema no sistema administrativo das organizações governamentais.

Palavras-chave: Direito de Gestão do Serviço Civil. Patologia. Atitude Sistemática. Estratégias de Recursos Humanos.

Introduction

Since human resources are the most important factor and axis of organizations, equipping and preparing these resources to face change is of special importance and all organizations with any type of mission must have the most capital, time and Dedicate the program to raising human beings in different dimensions (Aminnejad et al., 2015). The foundation of any organization is its human resources and for the success of organizations, the most qualified people should be used in the most suitable job positions (Sham et al., 2018). Organizations are social phenomena that are conscious, coordinated and have a relatively clear boundary with the environment and work continuously to achieve a goal or goals (Arman and Joshaghani, 2015).

For the other hand, in the field of human resources, one of the most important and challenging laws that has been implemented in the Iranand has affected many of the current affairs of the Iranis the "Civil Service Management Law". This law in 15 chapters and 128 articles in different chapters with a comprehensive approach to the role, strategies and technology of government duties, organizational structure of agencies, human resources management framework of government agencies, a new model of salaries and benefits of employees, the system of evaluation and management of performance and social security and retirement has been considered (Aminnejad et al., 2015). Considering the various aspects of the issue, including the review of the shortcomings of the previous regulations, the overlap of this law with the previous regulations, its relationship with the General Policy Implementation Law of Article 44 of the Constitution (adopted in 2008) in various fields, especially In the field of executive power and also its relationship with the reform of consumption pattern and productivity of human resources, especially how to improve the consumption pattern in the public sector, it is necessary to examine the law and the principles and principles of each chapter (Ronagh, 2009). According to the Civil Service Management Law in the field of human resources, this problem is more apparent; Because now, with the help of knowledge and

experience, it has been proven that most of the difficulties of organizations and their managers are directly or indirectly related to manpower issues (Mohammadi et al., 2016). Therefore, the pathology of the current situation of Iranian government organizations in terms of human resources is of particular importance with the prevailing systemic approach and design of paths to the desired situation in human resources.

So, the pathology process will be complete if it is comprehensive (Bessel and Kim, 2008). Organizational pathology studies in the first step with various tests, identify the type of disease of the organization and in the next step to treat the disease, strategies and related treatment prescriptions, while creating balance in the system and increasing organizational productivity., Brings positive consequences for society and the organization (Pouras and Berg, 2008). Human capital is defined as the collective knowledge, skills, abilities, and characteristics of employees and managers of an organization that build capacity to gain a competitive advantage, and given the rapid advancement of human knowledge and information, everything is changing drastically.

In the last few decades, we have witnessed the scattered, cross-sectional, expedient and partial, non-systemic, step-by-step or mere step-by-step efforts to solve the complex and intertwined problems of society as a whole and the administrative system in general. Special is not enough and does not lead to a better place (Mirsapasi and Qahramani, 2011). The reason for the inadequacy of this approach has been wisely stated by Peter Singe (1998): We have been taught from childhood that problems must be broken, that the world must be crushed. This seems to make it easier to deal with complex issues. But in fact we pay a very high hidden price for it. We will no longer be able to see the sequence of our actions, and we will lose that inner sense of connection to a more comprehensive whole. Although the understanding of the importance of a systems perspective in macro management has been evident from the beginning of the emergence and growth of the field of management, but at the beginning of the new millennium and given events of great historical importance, the importance of a holistic system perspective is emphasized (Castells, 2006).

Also, the administrative reform is one of the constant actions of governments around the world (Farazmand, 2001). In most of the developed countries of the world, governments have made fundamental changes in the structure and re-creation of government in order to deal with the emerging threats and to satisfy as many citizens as possible (Al-Omari and Al-Omari, 2006). Reconstruction means a fundamental change in government systems and organizations in order to increase the efficiency, effectiveness, adaptability and capacity of innovations (Kheirandish et al., 2016). Our Irandoes not need to make these changes; Because the Iranian administrative system has many problems and damages that eliminating them and building a new, dynamic and efficient system requires a review of existing rules and a fundamental review of all existing norms and institutions (Barati et al., 2013). One of the measures taken in this regard is the Civil Service Management Law. This law, which was approved in 2007 with the aim of solving the problems of the administrative system, was communicated to the government agencies for implementation. The provisions of this law have either not been implemented or have been implemented incompletely (Salehi et al., 2018). The Civil Service Management Law, which was implemented with the aim of integrating administrative systems in all executive bodies and performing partiality and creating proportionality in payment systems in the country, but due to the shortcomings and ambiguities in The performance faced it, over time, and lost its

integrity (Shahlaei, 2017). A law that was supposed to be the breadth of the country's administrative system and included all ministries, government agencies, agencies with public non-governmental organizations, government companies, and all agencies that are required by law to be named or specified. Involvement has become an ineffective law (Maliki et al., 2016).

The areas of human resource management in this study are the systematic performance of tasks based on the chapters of the Civil Service Law, such as; entry into service, employment, appointment and promotion in (system of recruitment, supply and adjustment); Salaries and benefits, salaries and duties of employees, social security in (maintenance and protection system); Employee empowerment is a performance appraisal in (education and improvement system) which has been observed in the researches of Qitani et al. (2017) and Mohammadi et al. (2015). If the human resource management system is not properly designed, managers and employees in this field are not carefully selected and obsessively selected, or at least will not keep pace with the needs of the day. Because the recruitment of appropriate manpower is only part of the human resource management system and the other part is to maintain the quality of manpower and develop their capabilities, which is done in the form of training programs. Also, if a proper evaluation system is not designed, so that there is no difference between good and bad performance, naturally the motivation for useful activities and valuable efforts in people decreases and manpower goes into recession and daily life. Will be guided. Giurian and Rabiee (2002) have written in this regard how many policies are made and compiled at different levels and positions of policy-making and legislation. But when they are in the implementation stage, they do not have the necessary efficiency and effectiveness and face obstacles and problems. Another problem with the way policies is implemented is the lack of a generalist idea. When policy makers or decision makers pay attention to one aspect of the issue and neglect the other aspects, incomplete results will be obtained in practice (Dana Esfahani and Taherpour, 2012). Therefore, the general purpose of the study is to examine the pathology of the Civil Service Management Law with a systemic approach to the areas of human resource management and to provide appropriate solutions for government organizations.

Methodology

Considering that the present study is the pathology of the Civil Service Management Law with emphasis on the systemic approach to the field of human resources and providing appropriate solutions in government organizations (Mirsapasi and Qahramani, 2011). It ultimately leads to a practical model, a fundamental research. In this research, to eliminate the shortcomings in previous research, it uses a qualitative approach (Aminnejad et al., 2015). Therefore, its multifaceted, comprehensive approach is covered in this way and also according to various considerations by experts at the level of the country's employment organization, the country's administrative education organization, Iran University of Medical Sciences, the country's management and planning organization and the social office of the Islamic Consultative Assembly (Maliki et al., 2016). According to the causal conditions, context and intervener, in addition to internal variables, external and environmental variables have also been considered. In fact, this study seeks to address the pathology of the Civil Service Management Law in its true context. One of the different types of qualitative research strategies is the

theoretical method derived from data, which has been considered in this research due to some of its special features (Barati et al., 2013).

For the pathology of the Civil Service Management Law in this research through in-depth interviews related to data theory, the statistical population includes officials of the Employment Organization, Administrative Education Organization, Iran University of Medical Sciences, Management and Planning Organization and the Social Office of the Islamic Consultative Assembly (Aminnejad et al., 2015).

In this research, a combination of purposeful judgment methods and snowball method has been used to select the sample, which is a non-probabilistic method (Castells, 2006). In this method, the work was started by people who were experts in this field and had the necessary criteria, and in addition to research questions, they were asked to introduce other experts in this field. Therefore, except for the first few people who were directly selected by the researcher based on the desired criteria. Other experts have been selected by other experts in addition to the expertise criteria (Farazmand, 2001). On the other hand, the adequacy of sampling is achieved by theoretical sampling method. In this method, sampling continues until the researcher has the most information about the subject of research and knowledge of the phenomenon. In doing this, they use methods that require simultaneous selection and sequential selection of data and their analysis.

Table 1 – Statistical samples

	Organization unit	gender	Academic degree		age	
2	Iran Employment Organization		1	B.A	1	25-35
1	Iran Administrative Affairs Training Organization		3	M.A	4	36-45
1	Iran University of Medical Sciences	8 male			4	46-55
1	Social Office of the Islamic Consultative Assembly of Iran		5	PhD		
3	Iran Management and Planning Organization				1	More than 55
1	Designer of Iran's national employment law	1 female				

Source: Authors' elaboration.

Steps of creating human resource pathology with a systemic approach

The first question asked of the participants in the interview was "What are the disadvantages of the Civil Service Management Law with its emphasis on the prevailing nature of generalization in the field of human resource management in Iranian government organizations?" In response to this question and based on the participants' views, four areas of recruitment, employment and supply and maintenance of human resources were mentioned and the harms of the law in terms of generalization characteristics such as lack of systems, severe bureaucracy and neglect of the environment were examined.

General view

This factor can be divided into four categories: recruitment, employment and supply and maintenance of human resources. According to the officials of the government agencies, the Civil Service Law has covered the systems of recruitment, employment and provision and maintenance of human resources. Some organizations consider the approvals of the National Board of Trustees to attract and retain manpower to be much more effective than the Civil Service Law. Basically, the position of a general law with a general attitude in human resource management is felt. One of the harms of the Civil Service Law is ignoring the environment despite extensive communication.

Table 2 – Results of the holistic feature of the human resources system

features	concept	criteria	code
General view	Current situation	Recruitment system	CE8
		Recruitment system	CE24
	harm	Supply system	CE16
		Human resource maintenance system	CE37
		Education system	CE41
		Lack of immune system	ST3
		Lack of health system	ST67
		Lack of competency system	ST8
		Strict bureaucracy to respond to the client	ST86
		Ignore the environment despite extensive communication	ST57

Source: Authors' elaboration.

The second question asked of the participants in the interview was "What are the disadvantages of the Civil Service Management Law with emphasis on the nature of coordination between system components (principle of non-conflict) in the field of human resource management in Iranian government organizations?" In response to this question, and from the point of view of the participants, there is a clear discrepancy between the law on public administration and the field of human resources.

Inconsistency

One of the weaknesses of the Civil Service Management Law is the inconsistency between the components of the system. Thus, before the adoption of the management law in the country, there was a national employment law, and after that, the payment system was created, with the greatest focus on the payment system. Civil Service Management Law in two parts, the first part of which is the Law on Public Administration and the other part is the field of human resources. The main idea of the formation of the country's management law has been influenced by the word modern government management. In its content, there are roots of assignments, privatizations, etc., which form the keywords of the first two chapters. In the field of human resource management, there is no coordination between these two main parts. If we want to act on the basis of modern government management. We have to give the authority to

the managers and they manage it and ask them to respond, including the authority to recruit and provide services to the manager. Because we want to dominate management. Another disadvantage is the lack of coordination between the service compensation system and the competency system. Service compensation is not defined for qualified individuals. One of the harms of civil service law is ignoring knowledge management in civil service law.

Table 3 – Results of the characteristics of inconsistency and coordination of the human resources system

feature	concept	index	code
Consistency and inconsistency	Harm (Inconsistency between the Department of Public Affairs and the field of human resources)	Do not outsource administrative affairs	MT3
		Lack of performance-based payment system	MT5
		Lack of transparency of central justice in the system of attraction	MT18
		Lack of delegation to managers in the field of recruitment	MT21
		Lack of incentive incentives to provide services to qualified people	MT29
	Current situation (Coordination between the Department of Public Affairs and the field of human resources)	Career promotion based on the educational system	MS5
		In line with payment with the education system	MT11

Source: Authors' elaboration.

The third question asked of the participants in the interview was "What are the disadvantages of the Civil Service Management Law with emphasis on the nature of interdependence and interaction between system components (principle of combined thinking) in the field of human resource management in Iranian government organizations?" In response to this question and based on the participants' point of view, interaction and non-interaction between the components is observed.

Dependence and interaction between system components (principle of hybrid thinking)

One of the disadvantages of the Civil Service Law is the lack of attention to detail, which has led to the interaction and dependence between the components of the system. The lack of a schematic and unified picture of the implementation processes of the Civil Service Law in the field of human resources with the slightest changes confuses people, which has led people to make decisions based on experience. Government officials believe that the interaction of the components does not lead to synergy, but has caused many problems.

Table 4 – Results of the nature of dependence and interaction between components of human resource systems

feature	concept	index	code
Dependence and interaction between system components (principle of hybrid thinking)	Harm	Managers' mental perception of the	KT4
	(Lack of dependence and interaction between components)	concepts of civil service such as retirement	KT6
		Lack of schematic and single image of the executive processes of the Civil Service Law	
		Do not anticipate changes	KT14
		Individual experiences in the face of change	KT13
		Lack of maintenance of capable people due to the weakness of the compensation system	KT15
		Restrictions and simplifications throughout the law	KT24
	Current situation (Dependence and interaction between components)	Interaction between system components through board decisions	KM8

Source: Authors' elaboration.

4-The fourth question asked of the participants in the interview was "What are the disadvantages of the Civil Service Management Law with its emphasis on getting feedback on the performance of system components in the areas of human resource management in the Iranian government organization?" In response to this question and based on the view of the participants, there is no feedback on the performance of the system to amend the Civil Service Management Law.

Feedback from system component performance

Each organization has defined different indicators to measure the performance of human resources. Based on performance points, rewards are considered for employees. However, the performance of human resources can be attributed to the performance of the Civil Service Law, which is not provided for in the Civil Service Law. Also, fundamental review of the law, lack of a clear regulatory system, failure to determine evaluation criteria in the implementation of the law, failure to determine regulatory authorities, lack of commitment of law enforcement officials, self-interest of employees and lack of mental discipline in enforcement are the main reasons for feedback.

5-The fifth question asked of the participants in the interview was "What are the disadvantages of the Civil Service Management Law with emphasis on paying attention to dynamic system processes (instead of static processes) in the field of human resource management in Iranian government organizations?" In response to this question and based on the participants' views, they expressed the weaknesses of static processes and dynamic system solutions.

Pay attention to dynamic system processes (instead of static processes)

All the officials of the governmental organizations unanimously believe that the processes of the system are static, which are due to the modeling of developed countries and do not pay attention to the work environment and the characteristics of the employed person. Therefore, in most of the topics, the generalities are addressed and the uniformity of job description is considered in the same way for all organizations, regardless of the specialization and working hours and the type of work of the individual. Therefore, the processes of the human resources system are completely static and uniform, which has created many problems due to this feature.

Table 5 – Characteristic Results Paying attention to the dynamic processes of human resource systems

Features	concepts	indexes	codes
Pay attention to dynamic system processes (instead of static processes)	Harm (Weaknesses of static processes)	The entry of unworthy people through the weakness of the service law	AC1
		Law enforcement perception based on personal interests and resources	AC9
		Uniformity of job descriptions for all government organizations	AC15
		Modeling processes from developed countries regardless of Iran's environmental conditions	AC19
		Finality of the law regardless of the time	AC23
		Inflexibility	AC25
	Current situation (Dynamic solutions)	System Dynamics Tool Regulations	AM3
		Digital technologies as quasi-dynamic structures	AM6

Source: Authors' elaboration.

The sixth question asked of the participants in the interview was "What are the disadvantages of the Civil Service Management Law with emphasis on the nature of the system's environmental relationship in the areas of human resource management in Iranian government organizations?" In the previous question, it was stated that the human resources system does not have dynamism and interaction; which has also affected the nature of environmental communication. Officials of government organizations have addressed the issue from the perspective of customer service, the perspective of underlying factors, internal and external labor force, adaptability or non-adaptability, and the perspective of conflict of delegation to organizations in relation to the environment.

Table 6 – Results of environmental communication characteristics of human resource systems

Features	concepts	Indexes	code
System environmental communication	Customer service perspective	Not helping to improve the country's business environment	EC5
		Lack of proper regulations for labor market preparation	EC8
		Lack of proper implementation of labor market training law	EC13
		Non-compliance of labor market training regulations with the Civil Service Law	EC15
	Perspectives of contextual factors	Lack of attention to a worthy performer	EC18
		Lack of competition with the private sector in the Civil Service Law	EC19
		Lack of proper maintenance tools	EC23
	Internal and external labor force	High labor demand to enter foreign markets	EC28
		Reduction of qualified forces	EC31
	Adaptability or non-adaptability	Lack of willingness of employees to improve knowledge and skills	EC32
		Law enforcement regardless of individual merit	EC36
	Conflict view of delegating tasks to organizations	Assign tasks from one organization to another	EC38
		Ambiguity in performing tasks due to the presence of multiple executors	EC41

Source: Authors' elaboration.

The seventh and eighth questions asked to the participants in the interview were: "What are the disadvantages of the Civil Service Management Law with emphasis on the characteristics of inputs (outputs) and outputs (outputs) of the system in the field of human resource management in Iranian government organizations?"

Inputs and outputs of system

The input of the human resource management system includes recruiting, meriting people, retaining human capital and compensating for services. The output of the human resources system is related to job performance and the pension system. Thus, the Civil Service Management Law for various reasons such as inflexibility, uncoordinated subsystems, static, non-dependence and interaction of the subsystem, etc. has led to various consequences in the input and output parts of the system. Consequences of entering the system include lack of recruitment of qualified manpower, central taste in employment, inability to retain manpower, non-payment of wages based on performance and lack of job and job characteristics. Also, the consequences of the system output include increasing the unemployment rate of the society, poor job performance, inefficiency due to inefficiency of the system, lack of attractiveness for retirement, job dissatisfaction, inefficiency and productivity of the human resources system, lack of delegation to managers, lack of specific promotion processes.

Table 7 – Characteristics results of inputs and outputs of human resource systems

features	concepts	indexes	code
System inputs and outputs	Harms of system inputs	Lack of decent manpower	IN5
		Central taste in hiring	IN8
		Inability to retain manpower	IN12
		Non-payment of wages based on performance	IN16
	Harms of system outputs	Lack of job and job characteristics	IN18
		Rising unemployment in the community	OU6
		Poor job performance	OU8
		Inefficiency due to inefficiency of the system	OU9
		Lack of attractiveness for retirement	OU11
		Job dissatisfaction	OU16
		Inefficiency and productivity of the human resources system	OU18
		Not delegating authority to managers	OU21
Lack of specific upgrade processes	OU23		

Source: Authors' elaboration.

After determining the final list of violations of the Civil Service Law, managers of government agencies and experts were asked to comment on the effectiveness of each of the identified components in identifying injuries based on a systemic approach based on the five Likert scale.

Results

In the first round, Delphi experts have identified a list of components of the pathology of national law in the field of human resources with a view to systemic features. They were also asked to add and suggest the components they wanted in this list, in addition to the activities and components available. Examination of the answers to open-ended questions in the first-round questionnaires showed that the activities or factors suggested by the respondents were not conceptually identical to the literature, which was added for the second round. In all stages, determining the importance of factors in the form of the likelihood spectrum in each round for each factor, the average responses of panel members in the previous rounds and the response of each person were separately informed to the respondents. In this study, a five-point scale and a Likert scale were selected, including very high to very low impact options.

In this study, Kendall coordination coefficient was used to determine the degree of consensus among panel members. This comparative coefficient is used to determine the degree of coordination and agreement of several ranks related to N object or person. The value of this scale is between 0 and 1. 9 members of Delphi panel have completed the questionnaire. Finally, Kendall's coordination coefficient has improved significantly after three periods.

Table 8 – Calculation of Kendall coefficient for statistical results in the first to third stage of Delphi

Items	First period		Second period		Third period	
	number	Kendal coefficient	number	Kendal coefficient	number	Kendal coefficient
Injuries related to generalization	9	0.43	9	0.51	9	0.67
Disorders related injuries	9	0.50	9	0.5	9	0.68
Injuries related to coordination	9	0.61	9	0.73	9	0.75
Damages related to the law enforcement environment	9	0.50	9	0.54	9	0.68
Injuries related to domestic and foreign labor	9	0.71	9	0.73	9	0.80
Adaptability or non-adaptability	9	0.53	9	0.64	9	0.73
Incoherence	9	0.61	9	0.72	9	0.76
Damages related to dynamic processes	9	0.53	9	0.64	9	0.67
Feedback on the performance of system components	9	0.52	9	0.61	9	0.67
Damages related to the lack of interdependence between components	9	0.63	9	0.65	9	0.69
Injuries related to input properties	9	0.65	9	0.63	9	0.74
Damages related to the properties of the outputs	9	0.62	9	0.73	9	0.77

Source: Authors' elaboration.

Investigating the results of violations of the Civil Service Management Law in the field of human resources based on the characteristics of the systemic attitude resulting from exploratory factor analysis

Figure 1 – Violations of the Civil Service Law in the field of human resources based on the characteristics of the systemic approach

<p>Features of general view</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lack of safe system • Lack of healthy system • Lack of meritocracy system • Severe Bureaucracy to customer response 	<p>Features of coordination and inconsistency</p> <p>Inconsistency</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Do not outsource administrative affairs • Lack of performance-based payment system • Lack of transparency of central justice in the employment system • Lack of motivational incentives to compensate for deserving people <p>Coordination</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Career promotion based on the educational system • Alignment of payment with the educational system
<p>Features of environmental communication of system</p> <p>Customer service delivery viewpoint</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Not helping to improve the business environment • Lack of proper regulations for preparing the labor market • Lack of proper implementation of labor law training law • Non-compliance of labor market training regulations with the Iranian Civil Service Law 	<p>Perspectives on environmental law enforcement factors</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lack of attention to a worthy performer • Lack of competitiveness with the private sector • Lack of proper maintenance tools <p>Internal and external labor force</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • High labor demand to enter the labor market • Reduction of qualified forces <p>Adaptability or non-adaptability</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Unwillingness of employees to improve skills • Law enforcement regardless of individual merit <p>Lack of coherence in the tasks of organizations</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Assigning the tasks of one organization to another <p>Ambiguity in performing tasks due to the presence of multiple executors</p>

Source: Authors' elaboration.

Discussion

This research, like other studies and researches, is not without limitations. One of the main limitations of the present study was the scope of the Civil Service Law. Although government agencies have used the Civil Service Law in the field of human resources, they have had many interpretations of the law. Therefore, the researcher had to integrate the scattered information in different fields in a relatively long process for analysis. Another limitation of the study was the large number of injuries, which led to the collection and classification over a period of 6 months. Also, values, perceptions, mentalities, perceptions, interests, knowledge and characteristics and knowledge of the researcher and other personal characteristics such as the ability to interact with others, etc. in choosing open source, categories, question design, questionnaire, communication with others and work analysis Lays. This research is not safe from these effects and naturally, the characteristics, knowledge and interests of the researcher have also affected this research, which should be considered as one of the limitations of the research.

Government agencies face many challenges in the areas of recruitment, retention, salaries and benefits, empowerment, performance appraisal, and IT effectiveness. Issues and problems of recruitment and employment in the Civil Service Law, including the lack of operational criteria in Article 41 "Entry into the service and determination of employment qualifications of individuals, implementation of top-down laws, education and experience in Article 70 of the Civil Service Law" And the effective role of managers in accepting people based on ethnic, religious, political and friendship affiliations, non-observance of the principle of equal opportunities for women and religious ethnicities, indefinite increase of entry requirements through Article 43 of the law, individual interpretation of volunteer age, ambiguity in the condition University education in some occupations such as the jobs of the Prisons Organization and security and educational measures, the existence of the condition of not being convicted of corruption contrary to the principle of equality, the ambiguity of the condition of adherence to the law of the Islamic Republic of Iran according to results the ambiguity in the field of general examination materials of the entry of devices, unilateral change of employment laws and regulations and the need to review employment laws with regard to most complaints of the Court of Administrative Justice related to employment. The issues raised in recruitment and employment are consistent with the researches of Rostami (2010), Purkiani et al. (2014), Mohammadi et al. (2015) and Najabatkhah and Faqih Larijani (2015).

Issues and problems of the Civil Service Law in the maintenance sector include the direct influence of the government in the implementation of maintenance processes, ignoring organizational differences and social contexts of organizations, ambiguity in how to maintain the status of official and survey staff, ambiguity in manpower maintenance laws with fixed job insecurity of official employees has been redeemed as a result of evaluations. Ambiguity in the rules of the probationary period, ambiguity in the law of the provision of unemployment insurance for the employees of the executive bodies who are facing redemption or non-renewal of the contract. Ambiguity in the characteristics of employees according to "Article 45; Clause A »The executive body should be aware of the existence of attributes such as merit, creativity, expertise, interest in work, innovation, lack of meritocracy due to ambiguity in 12 competency categories, neglect of employees' career path and shifting values and lack of talent management

to encourage and keep the talents. The issues raised in the maintenance section are consistent with the researches of Azar and Latifi (2008), Harisinejad et al. (2017) and Salehi et al. (2015).

Issues and problems of the Civil Service Law in the field of empowerment include one-sidedness of the staff training system index as empowerment and not paying attention to other indicators of staff empowerment, not paying attention to two dimensions of individual and organization in empowerment, not paying attention to the personality-job fit index Career path is paying attention to general and general skills and not measuring job-related skills, not considering the risk index in employee empowerment, not considering the responsibility index in employee empowerment and not caring about the impact of higher education on future employee empowerment; The issues raised in the empowerment section are consistent with the researches of Attarian et al. (2016) and Salehi et al. (2015).

Issues and problems of the Civil Service Law in the field of salaries and benefits include the interpretation of the law by individuals and different interpretations of salaries and benefits, unfamiliarity of employees in the discussion of payment law, ambiguity of implementation and answering questions and protests of employees. Lack of bylaws, mechanisms and executive instructions of salaries and benefits that are required for the implementation of this law 55 bylaws, irregular payment of wages, difference in payments between different occupational groups despite the same conditions, discrimination in the interpretation of payroll and benefits by managers, inadequacy Increase of salaries with inflation rate and cost of living index, creation of legal gap between retirees, non-observance of the law of coordinated system of payment of salaries of government employees, decrease of purchasing power of retirees and pensioners, dissatisfaction of retirees and pensioners of the Armed Forces; The issues raised in the benefits law section are consistent with the research of Barati et al. (2013), Mohammadi et al. (2016), Najabatkhah and Faqih Larijani (2016) and Shahlaei (2017).

Issues and problems of the Civil Service Law in the performance appraisal section include lack of comprehensive reporting of internal issues and problems of organizations and lack of action plans by government organizations, weakness in individual performance management, lack of motivation indicators, lack of functional skills development program, lack of attention According to the criteria of the executive roadmap for transformation in the administrative system, according to the requirements of the executive body in evaluating the performance of employees, lack of logical relationship between organizational strategy and human capital strategy, not considering the level of accountability and responsibility, taking into account individual characteristics of employees in evaluations. Rewards and punishments and not paying attention to the issue of education and empowerment system of government employees, along with paying attention to the maturity of the knowledge management system, lack of indicators for measuring intelligence (logical intelligence, emotional intelligence, cultural intelligence and spiritual intelligence), lack of preparation and route planning Career advancement, lack of assessment of the suitability of the candidates for management positions with managerial positions, lack of simulated tests to measure the readiness and ability to make decisions are important conditions that the issues raised in the performance appraisal section with The researches of Barati et al. (2013), Attarian et al. (2016) and Mohammadi and Sharifzadeh (2017) are consistent.

Issues and problems of the Civil Service Law The information and communication technology systems have not been used well, and this has led to problems such as the lack of integration of services provided to the people, improvement through Internet portals, the existence of paperwork and long processes in providing services, the existence of information. Accurate and sufficient to make the right decision include lack of training in the use of government services, limiting the provision of services to a certain level due to lack of infrastructure; Which is consistent with the research of Khairandish et al. (2016).

Conclusion

Finally, it is suggested to future researchers that due to the lack of technology such as virtual cloud hosts, online video, web analyst in Iran, in future research, human resources systems with emphasis on information technology systems (employment awareness, systems-based training, Performance evaluation system based on management dashboards, awareness of upgrading and updating instructions, employee participation in social networks to raise the violations of the Civil Service Law and launching a suggestion system, analysis of employee behaviors including entry and exit based on artificial intelligence and ...) should also be considered.

Also, the existence of ambiguity in the implementation of the law is one of the problems in the field of implementation, while the legal texts should be clear, transparent and transparent so that the executors do not have doubts and ambiguities in the implementation and from different interpretations and Avoid with tasteful interpretations. It is suggested that the transparency of the law be addressed by using the approved regulations of the decisions of the Board of Trustees. It is necessary for future researchers to be aware of the regulations before the interview and the questionnaire.

References

- Adel, A., Latifi, M. (2008). Revenue on process requirements and criteria for selecting government human resource managers. *Management Thought*, 2(2), 37-69. http://smt.journals.isu.ac.ir/article_116.html
- Al-Omari, A., & Al-Omari, H. (2006). E-Government Readiness Assessment Model. *Journal of Computer Science*, 2(11), 841-845. [10.3844/jcssp.2006.841.845](https://doi.org/10.3844/jcssp.2006.841.845)
- Aminnejad, K., Memarzadeh, G., & Mobini, M. (2015). Investigating the effectiveness of training courses in employee empowerment, subject to Article 58 of the Civil Service Management Law (Case study: Road, Housing and Urban Development Research Center). *Journal of Development and Transformation Management*, 21, 23-33. http://www.jdem.ir/article_466_3989d1aebc2d2a335890651583e45622.pdf
- Arman, M., & Joshaghani, H. (2015). Designing and validating a model for analyzing the status of the human resource management system. *Quarterly Journal of Human Resources Management Research*, 7(4), 71-94. https://hrmj.ihu.ac.ir/article_18675.html
- Attarian, F., Mirsapasi, N., & Musikhani, M. (2016). Pathology of amending the Civil Service Management Law with the approach of empowering the employees of government

- executive bodies. *Quarterly Journal of Public Management Mission*, 7, (22), 1-16.
http://ijpa.srbiau.ac.ir/article_9591.html
- Bissel, B.L., & Keim, J. (2008). Organizational diagnosis: The role of contagion groups. *The International Journal of Organizational Analysis*, 16(2), 7-15.
https://phad.ph.mahidol.ac.th/research/2558/149_Surachart.pdf
- Brown, D.R., Harvey, D. (1988). "An Experiential Approach to Organization Development", Upper Saddle River, NJ: Pearson Prentice Hall. <http://www.hrd-forum.com/wp-content/uploads/2018/05/Organizational-Development-ebook.pdf>
- Castells, M. (2006). *Information Age: Economy, Society and Culture (The Rise of a Network Society)*, Translated by Ahad Aliqlian and Afshin Khakbaz, Tarh-e No Publications, Tehran, Fifth Edition. <http://www.ipcsit.com/vol27/41-ICICN2012-N20009.pdf>
- Dana Isfahani, Z., & Taherpour, H. (2012). Identifying the effective factors on the implementation of Chapter 9 of the Civil Service Management Law (Employee Empowerment) in government organizations, *Quarterly Journal of Development and Transformation Management*, 4(11), 33-49.
<https://www.sid.ir/Fa/Journal/ViewPaper.aspx?ID=218793>
- Farazmand, A. (2001). *Administrative Reform in Developing Nations*. 1st Edition, London: Praeger Publishing. <https://www.gisoom.com/book/1301750>
- Forouzandeh Dehkordi, L. (2008). Investigating the role of new management theories in the Civil Service Management Law. *Tomorrow Management Magazine*, 7(19), 21-33.
<https://www.sid.ir/fa/journal/ViewPaper.aspx?ID=161961>
- Gharajedaghi, J. (2011). *Systems thinking: managing chaos and complexity: a platform for designing business architecture* (3rd ed.). Burlington, MA: Morgan Kaufmann.
<https://www.gisoom.com/book/11218144>
- Giurian, H., & Rabiee, M. (2002). *Decision Making and Determining Government Policy*, Yakan Publications: Tehran. <https://www.gisoom.com/book/1857601>
- Hadavand, M., & Kazemi, D. (2013). A reflection on the modern principles of administrative law in the Civil Service Management Law. *Strategy Quarterly*, 22(67), 127-140.
<http://tahavol.saminattech.ir/WebUsers/tahavol/Journals/jfilep5637126941132101956.pdf>
- Hall Mark, L., Cynthia, A., Lengnick-Hall, Leticia, S. Andrade & Brian Drake (2009). Strategic human resource management: The evolution of the field, *Human Resource Management Review*, 19, 64-85.
<https://www.sjsu.edu/people/stan.malos/docs/251%20Lengnick-Hall%201.pdf>
- Harisnejad, K., Jangjo, Farzad., & Lotfi, A.(2014). An analysis of the probationary period of employment in the Civil Service Management Law. *Administrative Law Quarterly*, 1(4), 89-112. <http://qjal.smtc.ac.ir/article-1-43-fa.html>
- Howard, A. (2004). *Diagnosis for Organizational Change: Methods and Models*. New York, NY: The Guilford Press. <https://catalogue.nla.gov.au/Record/1834414>
- Kheirandish, M., Hasanpour, A., & Falahzavareh, M. (2013). Pathology of the service compensation system with emphasis on the Civil Service Management Law. *Human Resources Quarterly*, 2(7), 78-99. <https://elmnet.ir/article/1010594-89311>
- Kheirandish, M., Shakeri, Gh., & Ghanizadeh, A.(2016). Pathology of the effectiveness of the use of information technology and administrative services in the Civil Service

- Management Law. *Quarterly Journal of Management of Government Organizations*, 3(14), 56-77. <http://ipom.journals.pnu.ac.ir/>
- Kolb, D. A. & Frohman, A. L. (2012). An Organization Development Approach to Consulting. *Sloan Management Review*, 12, 51-65. <https://learningfromexperience.com/about/David-Kolb-2020-curriculum-vitae.pdf>
- Mirsapasi, N., & Qahramani, M. (2011). The necessity of adapting the approach of fundamental change (macro implementation and based on systemic attitude) to the transformation plan in the administrative system of the Iranto improve and enhance the capability and capability of the government. *Quarterly Journal of Management Research*. 22(88), 1-22. <https://www.sid.ir/fa/Journal/ViewPaper.aspx?id=144889>
- Mohammadi, M., & Sharifzadeh, F. (2017). Designing a performance management model with a human resource development approach in the public sector. *Quarterly Journal of Human Resources Education and Development*, 4(15), 133-159. <https://www.sid.ir/fa/journal/ViewPaper.aspx?id=361410>
- Mohammadi, M., Alwani, S.M., & Memarzadeh, G. (2016). Designing a governance model for the implementation of human resource policies in the Iranian government (Case study: Civil Service Management Law). *Quarterly Journal of Management of Government Organizations*, 4(2), 13-30. http://ipom.journals.pnu.ac.ir/article_2743.html
- Nadler, D. A. & Tushman, M. L. (2006). A Model for Diagnosing Organizational Behavior. *Organizational Dynamics*, 9(2), 35-51. <https://www.hbs.edu/faculty/Pages/item.aspx?num=2974>
- Najabatkhah, M., & Faqih Larijani, F. (2016). A reflection on the jurisdiction of the Court of Administrative Justice to hear claims arising from employment contracts. *Journal of Public Law Studies*, 46(2), 231-245. https://jpls.ut.ac.ir/article_58195.html
- Porras, J.I., & Berg, P.O. (2008). The Impact of Organization Development. *Academy of Management Review*, 3, 249-266. <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/10.1177/0021886394303003>
- Purkiani, M., Salajeqeh, S., & Fezollah Z. (2014). Explaining barriers to policy implementation using centralized group discussion (Case study: Civil Service Management Law). *Quarterly Journal of Management of Government Organizations*. 30(9), 78-90. <https://www.sid.ir/fa/journal/ViewPaper.aspx?id=140544>
- Qitani, A., Memarzadeh, Gh., & Mirsapasi, N. (2017). Designing a human resource management model with a socio-technical and ecological approach for the Iranian public sector. *Public Management Perspectives*, 30, 74-57. <http://jpap.sbu.ac.ir/article/view/22689>
- Ronaq, Y. (2009). Civil Service Management Law regulating the relationship between government, people and employees. *Journal of Human Resources*, 2, 23-41. <https://hrmj.ihu.ac.ir/>
- Rostami, V. (2010). Legal review of entry into service and employment in the Civil Service Management Law (Chapters 7 and 8). *Critical Journal of Texts and Programs of Humanities, Institute of Humanities and Cultural Studies*, 10(2), 125-150. <http://ensani.ir/fa/article/272491>

- Salehi, S., Daneshfard, K., Mirsapasi, N., & Goodarzvand, M. (2018). Model of human resources supply and adjustment system (research in the Civil Service Management Law). *Quarterly Journal of Human Resource Management Research, Imam Hossein University*, 10 (2), 75-100. https://hrmj.ihu.ac.ir/article_32464_d53bba827fd76a865f284e4e02631d94.pdf
- Shahlaei, N. (2017). Pathology of the legal system and benefits of the armed forces. *Defense Strategy Quarterly*, 15(59), 1-30. https://ds.sndu.ac.ir/article_104.html
- Shum, C., Gatling, A., & Shoemaker, S. (2018). A model of hospitality leadership competency for frontline and director-level managers: Which competencies matter more? *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 74, 57-66. [10.1016/j.ijhm.2018.03.002](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijhm.2018.03.002)
- Singe, P. (2008). *Fifth Commandment: Creating a Learning Organization*. Translated by Hafez Kamal Hedayat and Mohammad Roshan. Tehran: Industrial Management Organization Publications, Tehran. http://journal.cesir.ir/article_106850_09232b5ff1961ed5b2a5e901b72e289c.pdf